# Exotics on the Lattice 

Gavin Cheung<br>Hadron Spectrum Collaboration

DAMTP, University of Cambridge

12 December 2017

## Introduction



Essential to understand this within QCD. Can we reproduce this spectrum theoretically?
S. Olsen, arxiv:1511.01589

## Lattice QCD

- Lattice QCD is the only systematically improvable method for performing first principle calculations involving hadrons.


## Lattice QCD

- Lattice QCD is the only systematically improvable method for performing first principle calculations involving hadrons.
- Discretisation of spacetime allows for numerical computation of two-point correlation functions $\left\langle\mathcal{O}(t) \mathcal{O}^{\dagger}(0)\right\rangle$ for lots of operators.


## Lattice QCD

- Lattice QCD is the only systematically improvable method for performing first principle calculations involving hadrons.
- Discretisation of spacetime allows for numerical computation of two-point correlation functions $\left\langle\mathcal{O}(t) \mathcal{O}^{\dagger}(0)\right\rangle$ for lots of operators.

$$
\begin{aligned}
\left\langle\mathcal{O}(t) \mathcal{O}^{\dagger}(0)\right\rangle & =\langle 0| \mathcal{O}(t) \mathcal{O}^{\dagger}(0)|0\rangle \\
& \left.=\sum_{n}|\langle 0| \mathcal{O}| n\right\rangle\left.\right|^{2} e^{-M_{n} t}
\end{aligned}
$$

## Lattice QCD

- Lattice QCD is the only systematically improvable method for performing first principle calculations involving hadrons.
- Discretisation of spacetime allows for numerical computation of two-point correlation functions $\left\langle\mathcal{O}(t) \mathcal{O}^{\dagger}(0)\right\rangle$ for lots of operators.

$$
\begin{aligned}
\left\langle\mathcal{O}(t) \mathcal{O}^{\dagger}(0)\right\rangle & =\langle 0| \mathcal{O}(t) \mathcal{O}^{\dagger}(0)|0\rangle \\
& \left.=\sum_{n}|\langle 0| \mathcal{O}| n\right\rangle\left.\right|^{2} e^{-M_{n} t}
\end{aligned}
$$

- The spectrum is contained in the two-point correlation function and can be extracted. What about $\mathcal{O}$ ?


## Meson Operators

- We want to build good operators with the correct quantum numbers of the states we're interested in. Starting with fermion bilinears,

$$
\mathcal{O}(t) \sim \bar{c} \Gamma c
$$

## Meson Operators

- We want to build good operators with the correct quantum numbers of the states we're interested in. Starting with fermion bilinears,

$$
\mathcal{O}(t) \sim \bar{c} \Gamma c
$$

- 「 can only probe up to $J=1$. But we can do better! Add in some gauge-covariant derivatives to access any $J^{P C}$.

$$
\mathcal{O}(t) \sim \bar{c} \Gamma \overleftrightarrow{D} \ldots \overleftrightarrow{D} c
$$

## Meson Operators

- We want to build good operators with the correct quantum numbers of the states we're interested in. Starting with fermion bilinears,

$$
\mathcal{O}(t) \sim \bar{c} \Gamma c
$$

- 「 can only probe up to $J=1$. But we can do better! Add in some gauge-covariant derivatives to access any $J^{P C}$.

$$
\mathcal{O}(t) \sim \bar{c} \Gamma \overleftrightarrow{D} \ldots \overleftrightarrow{D} c
$$

- This construction also gives 'gluey' operators $\mathcal{O}(t) \propto F_{\mu \nu}$ that resemble a hybrid meson structure.

Results

## $c \bar{c}$ Spectrum at $m_{\pi} \sim 240 \mathrm{MeV}$



## $c \bar{c}$ Spectrum at $m_{\pi} \sim 240 \mathrm{MeV}$



## $c \bar{c}$ Spectrum at $m_{\pi} \sim 240 \mathrm{MeV}$



## $c \bar{c}$ Spectrum at $m_{\pi} \sim 240 \mathrm{MeV}$



## $c \bar{c}$ Spectrum at $m_{\pi} \sim 240 \mathrm{MeV}$



## Hybrid Mesons



Pattern consistent with adding an effective gluonic degree of freedom $J^{P C}=1^{+-}$to quark model.
$q \bar{q} L=0$

$$
\left\{0^{-+} ; 1^{--}\right\} \rightarrow\left\{1^{--} ; 0^{-+}, 1^{-+}, 2^{-+}\right\}
$$

## Hybrid Mesons



Pattern consistent with adding an effective gluonic degree of freedom $J^{P C}=1^{+-}$to quark model.
$q \bar{q} L=0$

$$
\left\{0^{-+} ; 1^{--}\right\} \rightarrow\left\{1^{--} ; 0^{-+}, 1^{-+}, 2^{-+}\right\}
$$

$q \bar{q} L=1$
$\left\{1^{+-} ; 0^{++}, 1^{++}, 2^{++}\right\} \rightarrow\left\{0^{++}, 1^{++}, 2^{++} ; 0^{+-}, 1^{+-}(3), 2^{+-}(2), 3^{+-}\right\}$

## Hybrid Mesons



Pattern consistent with adding an effective gluonic degree of freedom $J^{P C}=1^{+-}$to quark model.
$q \bar{q} L=0$

$$
\left\{0^{-+} ; 1^{--}\right\} \rightarrow\left\{1^{--} ; 0^{-+}, 1^{-+}, 2^{-+}\right\}
$$

$q \bar{q} L=1$

$$
\left\{1^{+-} ; 0^{++}, 1^{++}, 2^{++}\right\} \rightarrow\left\{0^{++}, 1^{++}, 2^{++} ; 0^{+-}, 1^{+-}(3), 2^{+-}(2), 3^{+-}\right\}
$$

These states are reliably seen when we include gluey operators in the calculation.

## $m_{\pi} \sim 240 \mathrm{MeV}$ vs $m_{\pi} \sim 400 \mathrm{MeV}$



## Four-quark Operators

- No multi-meson states seen in the previous spectrum. Need different operators?
- Meson-meson operators (M)

$$
\mathcal{O}(t) \sim\left(\bar{c} \Gamma q^{\prime}\right)(\vec{p}) \times\left(\bar{q} \Gamma^{\prime} c\right)(-\vec{p}) .
$$

- Tetraquark operators (T)

$$
\mathcal{O}(t) \sim G_{a d} \underbrace{\left(g_{a b c} c_{b}\left(C \Gamma_{1}\right) q_{c}^{T}\right)}_{\text {Diquark }} \underbrace{\left(g_{\text {def }} \bar{c}_{e}^{T}\left(\Gamma_{2} C\right) \bar{q}_{f}\right)}_{\text {Anti-diquark }} .
$$

## Finite-volume Spectrum $(c \bar{c} q \bar{q})$



- The energy levels are discrete in a finite volume. Momentum is quantised.
- We can plot the non-interacting meson-meson levels.
- Interactions cause deviations from the non-interacting levels. Forms the basis of the Lüscher formalism to determine scattering amplitudes from a Euclidean field theory.


## Finite-volume Spectrum ( $c \bar{c} q \bar{q})$



- In the non-interacting limit, we know how many meson-meson levels are in this channel. Will we see an 'extra' energy level of tetraquark origin?
- Will there be large shifts from the non-interacting levels suggesting a strong interaction? Hints of bound states or narrow resonances?


## Isospin-1 c $\bar{c} q \bar{q}$ Spectrum at $m_{\pi} \sim 400 \mathrm{MeV}$



GC, C.E.Thomas, J.J.Dudek, R.G.Edwards,
arXiv:1709.01417

- The number of energy levels we find is equal to the number of expected non-interacting meson-meson levels.
- Finite-volume spectrum lies close to non-interacting meson-meson levels suggesting there are weak meson-meson interactions.
- There is no strong indication for a bound state or narrow resonance in this channel. $Z_{C}$ (3900)?
- Tetraquark operators do not significantly affect the extraction of the spectrum.


## Isospin-1 c $\bar{c} q \bar{q}$ Spectrum at $m_{\pi} \sim 400 \mathrm{MeV}$



GC, C.E.Thomas, J.J.Dudek, R.G.Edwards,
arXiv:1709.01417

- The number of energy levels we find is equal to the number of expected non-interacting meson-meson levels.
- Finite-volume spectrum lies close to non-interacting meson-meson levels suggesting there are weak meson-meson interactions.
- There is no strong indication for a bound state or narrow resonance in this channel. $Z_{C}$ (3900)?
- Tetraquark operators do not significantly affect the extraction of the spectrum.

Isospin-1 hidden charm spectrum $(c \bar{c} q \bar{q})$ for $m_{\pi} \sim 400$ MeV


## Doubly-charmed spectrum $(c c \bar{q} \bar{q})$ for $m_{\pi} \sim 400 \mathrm{MeV}$



## Conclusions and outlook

- Lattice QCD is the only ab-initio way to study exotic mesons.
- In lattice QCD, we find states with exotic $J^{P C}$ quantum numbers and identify states that are consistent with a quark-antiquark combination coupled to a $1^{+-}$gluonic excitation.
- Turning to four-quark states, we do not find significant changes to spectrum when including a class of operators resembling tetraquarks in our calculations. The extracted spectrum does not show any clear signs of bound states or narrow resonances.
- Next steps: calculations towards physical point, study other interesting channels, relate the discrete finite volume spectrum to scattering amplitudes using the Lüscher formalism.

